**Annex I: Court cases and coding**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Issues under discussion** | **Issue 1: A** | **Issue 1: B** | **Issue 1: C** | **Issue 2: A** | **Issue 2: B** | **Issue 2: C** | **Issue 3: A** | **Issue 3: B** | **Issue 3: C** | **Issue 4: A** | **Issue 4: B** | **Issue 4: C** |
| **María Martínez Sala** | Issue 1: worker definition Issue 2: requirement of residence permit | DE | ES | COM | DE | ES, COM |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Grzelczyk** | Issue 1: exclusion of economically inactive  Issue 2: general exclusion of students even after their residence right was recognized | BE, DK, FR, UK, Coun-cil | PT, COM |  | BE, DK, FR, UK, Coun-cil |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Trojani** | Issue 1: right of residence based on economic activity Issue 2: right of residence based on EU citizenship, "limitations and conditions" | BE, DE, NL, FR, DK, UK | COM |  | BE, DE, NL, FR, DK, UK, COM |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Bidar** | Issue 1: scope of the Treaty / entitlement to subsidized loans or grants Issue 2: link | DE, AT, DK, FI, FR, NL, UK, COM |  |  | DE, AT, FI |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **De Cuyper** | Issue 1: requirement of actual residence | BE, DE, FR | COM |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Morgan and Bucher** | Issue 1: requirement of link | DE, AT, FI, NL, SE, UK, COM | IT |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Förster** | Issue 1: whether equal treatment of workers (ex reg. 1251/70) also applies to students who performed work on a small scale and have ceased such activities  Issue 2: whether the students' directive can pose an exception to the Treaty-based principle of equal treatment Issue 3: whether a certain period of residence (5 years) can be set as (the sole) condition before acquiring access to study grants | BE, DE, NL, AT, FI | COM |  | NL | BE, DE, AT, COM |  | BE, DE, NL, AT, FI, SE, UK | COM |  |  |  |  |
| **Vatsouras and Koupa-tantze** | Issue 1: provision/exclusion (Art. 24(2) of Directive 2004/38) compatible with Treaty?/ discriminating + undermining free movement? Issue 2: whether the principle of non-discrimination is compatible with a national regulation granting benefit to illegal migrants but not to EU migrants | DK, DE, NL, UK, EP, Coun-cil, COM |  |  | DE, NL, UK, COM |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Prinz and Seeberger\*** | Issue 1: national provision (requirement of three years of permanent residence in Member State of origin in order to be granted education or training grant for studies in another Member State) compatible with EU law? | AT, DE, NL, FI, SE, DK | COM |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Brey\*** | Issue 1: whether the compensatory supplement is to be regarded as a “social assistance” benefit within the terms contemplated in Article 7(1)(b) of Directive 2004/38 | AT, DE, NL, GR, IE, SE, UK | COM |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Dano\*** | Issue 1: whether persons who claim special non-contributory benefits under Article 3(3) and Art. 70 of Regulation 883/2004 fall within the scope of Article 4 of Regulation 883/2004 (equal treatment)  Issue 2: whether Member States are precluded by Article 4 of Regulation 883/2004 from excluding Union citizens from benefits under Art. 70 of Regulation 883/2004  Issue 3: whether Member States are precluded by (a) Article 18 TFEU and/or (b) [point (a) of the first subparagraph of Article 20(2)] TFEU in conjunction with the [second subparagraph] of Article 20(2) TFEU and Article 24(2) of Directive 2004/38/EC from excluding Union citizens from benefits under Art. 70 of Regulation 883/2004  Issue 4: whether Articles 1, 20 and 51 of the Charter must be interpreted as requiring the Member States to grant non-contributory benefits by way of basic provision such as to enable permanent residence or whether those States may limit their grant to the provision of funds necessary for return to the home State | DE | IE, COM |  | DE, IE, AT |  |  | DE, IE | COM |  | DE, IE |  |  |
| **Alimanovic\*** | Issue 1: whether equal treatment (Art. 4 Regulation 883/2004) also applies to the special non-contributory benefits under Article 70(1) and (2) of Regulation 883/2004  Issue 2: whether equal treatment may be limited by national provisions that implement Art. 24(2) Directive 2004/38 and do not grant benefits to Union citizens whose right of residence solely arises out of the search for employment  Issue 3: national provision excluding Union citizens, whose right of residence solely arises out of the search for employment, from the entitlement to a social benefit, intended to ensure subsistence and to facilitate access to the labour market compatible with Article 45(2) TFEU, [read] in conjunction with Article 18 TFEU?" | DE, IT | SE, IE |  | DE, IT, SE, IE |  |  | DE, IT, SE, IE |  |  |  |  |  |

Legend: A = “preserving national sovereignty”, B = “more Europe”, C = ambivalent;  
\* Due to the abolishment of the “Reports for the Hearing”, the analysis of these cases builds upon available written observations and the opinion of the Advocate General. Therefore, information on the following observations is missing: Greece in *Prinz and Seeberger*, the UK in *Dano* and the UK and the Commission in *Alimanovic* (Denmark and France delivered only oral observations for the latter two cases).