

Are we all Charlie? How media priming and framing affect immigration policy preferences after terrorist attacks

Øyvind Bugge Solheim, *Institute for Social Research (ISF), Oslo, and Department for Political Science, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway*

Online Appendix

Table 6. Effects of the attacks on immigration attitudes in five European countries (regions weight 1)

	Immigration policy	EU countries	Poor countries	Muslim	Jewish	Romani
Estimate	-0.065	-0.092	-0.064	-0.055	-0.055	-0.031
P-value	0.023	0.012	0.023	0.06	0.085	0.348
N	594	343	596	648	612	649
Regions	11	7	11	10	11	10
Countries	5	4	5	5	5	5

Table 7. Effects of the attacks on immigration attitudes in France (regions weight 1)

	Immigration policy	EU countries	Poor countries	Muslim	Jewish	Romani
Estimate	-0.03162	-0.04569	-0.02195	0.00882	0.023511	0.03106
P-value	0.36	0.159	0.553	0.838	0.46	0.55
N	197	197	198	198	196	197
Regions	3	3	3	3	3	3
P-value (diff)	0.223	0.175	0.2	0.169	0.041	0.486

Table 8. Effects of the attacks on immigration attitudes in five European countries (no weights)

	Immigration policy	EU countries	Poor countries	Muslim	Jewish	Romani
Estimate	-0.047	-0.073	-0.052	-0.072	-0.032	-0.057
P-value	0.031	0.021	0.02	0.002	0.171	0.019
N	594	343	596	648	612	649
Regions	11	7	11	10	11	10
Countries	5	4	5	5	5	5

Table 9. Results of the balance tests

Type of immigration	Type	Age	Female	In paid work	Income (decile)	Less Than Lower Secondary	Lower Secondary	Tertiary Education	Advanced Vocational	TV-news	Parents born in country	Upper Secondary
EU	Estimate	-2.65	0.04	-0.10	0.00	0.05	-0.05	-0.05	0.05	-0.06	0.01	0.00
	P-Value	0.26	0.58	0.17	0.99	0.44	0.17	0.42	0.39	0.55	0.91	0.96
Jewish	Estimate	-0.91	0.04	-0.07	0.10	0.03	-0.03	-0.05	0.02	-0.05	0.00	0.02
	P-Value	0.64	0.47	0.25	0.73	0.50	0.28	0.35	0.57	0.52	0.98	0.62
Muslim	Estimate	-0.32	0.05	-0.05	-0.01	0.06	-0.03	-0.06	0.03	-0.01	0.01	0.01
	P-Value	0.85	0.38	0.38	0.96	0.23	0.22	0.23	0.54	0.81	0.88	0.85
Policy	Estimate	-0.81	0.04	-0.07	0.12	0.04	-0.03	-0.05	0.02	-0.04	0.00	0.02
	P-Value	0.66	0.48	0.22	0.67	0.46	0.30	0.35	0.57	0.54	0.95	0.73
Poor countries	Estimate	-0.81	0.04	-0.07	0.12	0.04	-0.03	-0.05	0.02	-0.04	0.00	0.02
	P-Value	0.66	0.48	0.22	0.67	0.46	0.30	0.35	0.57	0.54	0.95	0.73
Romani	Estimate	-0.32	0.05	-0.05	-0.01	0.06	-0.03	-0.06	0.03	-0.01	0.01	0.01
	P-Value	0.85	0.38	0.38	0.96	0.23	0.22	0.23	0.54	0.81	0.88	0.85

Table 10. Regression results (OLS) from regressing Muslim immigration on TV-news use, different specifications

	<i>Dependent variable: Muslim immigration</i>				
	TV-news:				
	Log (1)	Dichotomous (2)	Continuous (3)	Log (only France) (4)	Log (not France) (5)
Constant	0.433*** (0.047)	0.097 (0.100)	0.302*** (0.069)	0.769*** (0.093)	0.401*** (0.053)
TV-news	0.070*** (0.020)	0.291*** (0.091)	0.066** (0.032)	0.0003 (0.018)	0.072*** (0.021)
After attack	-0.046** (0.021)	-0.225** (0.100)	-0.080** (0.038)	-0.012 (0.038)	-0.045** (0.022)
TV-news:After attack	0.038* (0.020)	0.171* (0.102)	0.016 (0.018)	-0.007 (0.028)	0.035* (0.021)
After attack:France	0.037 (0.050)	0.320* (0.189)	0.112 (0.088)		
TV-news:After attack:France	-0.061 (0.039)	-0.274 (0.195)	-0.032 (0.036)		
France	0.083* (0.043)	0.381*** (0.130)	0.194*** (0.073)		
TV-news:France	-0.063** (0.029)	-0.261* (0.135)	-0.055 (0.037)		
TV use (log)	-0.004 (0.019)	0.003 (0.018)	-0.009 (0.020)	0.052 (0.036)	-0.015 (0.022)
Age (Centered)	-0.001** (0.001)	-0.001** (0.001)	-0.001* (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)
Female	-0.002 (0.018)	-0.005 (0.018)	-0.011 (0.019)	-0.034 (0.038)	0.007 (0.021)
In paid work	0.013 (0.022)	0.020 (0.022)	0.004 (0.022)	-0.161*** (0.045)	0.042* (0.025)
Parents born in country	-0.018 (0.024)	-0.017 (0.024)	-0.012 (0.025)	-0.019 (0.040)	-0.013 (0.030)
Income (decile)	0.004 (0.004)	0.004 (0.004)	0.003 (0.004)	-0.001 (0.008)	0.005 (0.005)
Education(Upper Secondary as baseline)					
Less Than Lower Secondary	-0.00002 (0.030)	-0.002 (0.029)	0.008 (0.030)	-0.231*** (0.069)	0.029 (0.033)
Lower Secondary	-0.036	-0.040	-0.027	-0.187**	-0.010

	(0.047)	(0.047)	(0.048)	(0.086)	(0.057)
Advanced Vocational	0.055	0.055	0.065*	-0.050	0.063
	(0.034)	(0.034)	(0.035)	(0.084)	(0.038)
Tertiary Education	0.150***	0.157***	0.166***	-0.0004	0.166***
	(0.032)	(0.031)	(0.032)	(0.073)	(0.036)
Region CZ0	-0.315***	0.198*	-0.165***		-0.323***
	(0.039)	(0.116)	(0.062)		(0.041)
Region DE3	0.273***	0.273***	0.261**		0.271***
	(0.056)	(0.047)	(0.103)		(0.058)
Region DE7	0.126***	0.601***	0.307***		0.126**
	(0.048)	(0.214)	(0.079)		(0.051)
Region DE9	0.281***	0.570**	0.412***		0.275***
	(0.051)	(0.278)	(0.105)		(0.054)
Region FI1	-0.066*	0.522***	0.138**		-0.070*
	(0.038)	(0.153)	(0.066)		(0.040)
Region NL2	-0.039	0.052	0.083		-0.038
	(0.037)	(0.130)	(0.065)		(0.040)
TV-news:Region CZ0	-0.100***	-0.477***	-0.065*		-0.102***
	(0.027)	(0.121)	(0.036)		(0.028)
TV-news:Region DE3	0.069		-0.001		0.072
	(0.096)		(0.058)		(0.100)
TV-news:Region DE7	-0.101**	-0.432**	-0.087**		-0.096**
	(0.043)	(0.218)	(0.043)		(0.045)
TV-news:Region DE9	-0.078	-0.245	-0.062		-0.075
	(0.056)	(0.282)	(0.061)		(0.058)
TV-news:Region FI1	-0.123***	-0.542***	-0.095**		-0.123***
	(0.032)	(0.157)	(0.038)		(0.034)
TV-news:Region NL2	-0.032	-0.041	-0.065*		-0.031
	(0.028)	(0.133)	(0.035)		(0.029)
Observations	801	801	801	186	615
R ²	0.396	0.397	0.377	0.251	0.411
Adjusted R ²	0.373	0.375	0.354	0.194	0.386

Note:

$p < 0.1$; $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.01$

Table 11. Regression results (OLS) from regressing support for Jewish immigration and immigration policy on log transformed TV-news use

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>	
	Jewish immigration (1)	Immigration policy (2)
Constant	0.525*** (0.048)	0.539*** (0.043)
TV-news (log)	0.007 (0.021)	0.042** (0.018)
After attack	-0.049** (0.021)	-0.050*** (0.019)
TV-news (log):After attack	0.060*** (0.022)	0.022 (0.019)
After attack:France	0.086* (0.050)	0.020 (0.045)
TV-news (log):After attack:France	-0.064 (0.040)	-0.019 (0.036)
France	0.124*** (0.044)	0.010 (0.039)
TV-news (log):France	0.002 (0.029)	-0.056** (0.026)
TV use (log)	-0.009 (0.019)	-0.014 (0.017)
Age (Centered)	0.001 (0.001)	-0.001** (0.001)
Female	0.008 (0.019)	0.034** (0.017)
In paid work	-0.022 (0.022)	0.011 (0.020)
Parents born in country	-0.024 (0.025)	0.023 (0.022)
Income (decile)	0.0003 (0.004)	0.003 (0.004)
Education(Upper Secondary as baseline)		
Less Than Lower Secondary	0.024 (0.030)	-0.003 (0.027)
Lower Secondary	-0.034 (0.048)	0.037 (0.042)
Advanced Vocational	0.056 (0.035)	0.031 (0.031)

Tertiary Education	0.080** (0.032)	0.094*** (0.029)
Region CZ0	-0.085** (0.040)	-0.189*** (0.035)
Region DE3	0.335*** (0.063)	0.198*** (0.056)
Region DE7	0.275*** (0.054)	0.101** (0.048)
Region DE9	0.280*** (0.057)	0.189*** (0.051)
Region DEE	0.189*** (0.054)	0.118** (0.048)
Region FI1	0.007 (0.039)	-0.057* (0.034)
Region NL2	0.067* (0.038)	-0.069** (0.034)
TV-news (log):Region CZ0	-0.025 (0.027)	-0.044* (0.024)
TV-news (log):Region DE3	-0.055 (0.110)	-0.040 (0.099)
TV-news (log):Region DE7	-0.031 (0.049)	-0.027 (0.044)
TV-news (log):Region DE9	-0.029 (0.064)	-0.072 (0.057)
TV-news (log):Region DEE	-0.037 (0.046)	-0.055 (0.041)
TV-news (log):Region FI1	-0.085** (0.039)	-0.062* (0.035)
TV-news (log):Region NL2	0.0004 (0.029)	-0.001 (0.026)
Observations	764	747
R ²	0.251	0.281
Adjusted R ²	0.219	0.249
<i>Note:</i> * $p < 0.1$; ** $p < 0.05$; *** $p < 0.01$		

Table 12. Regression results (OLS) from regressing Muslim immigration on different control variables

	<i>Muslim immigration:</i>							
	Control variable:							
	Income	Income (log)	Years of education	Years of education (log)	TV-use	TV-use (log)	TV-use (dichotomous)	Political interest
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Constant	0.280*** (0.069)	0.238** (0.101)	0.381*** (0.106)	0.398 (0.258)	0.458*** (0.056)	0.436*** (0.036)	0.676*** (0.083)	0.332*** (0.043)
Control	0.029** (0.012)	0.127** (0.062)	0.005 (0.007)	0.018 (0.096)	-0.008 (0.011)	-0.038*** (0.015)	-0.268*** (0.081)	0.102*** (0.024)
After attack	-0.004 (0.049)	0.001 (0.058)	-0.037 (0.082)	-0.100 (0.200)	-0.075* (0.043)	-0.069*** (0.021)	-0.199** (0.091)	-0.021 (0.036)
Control:After attack	-0.008 (0.008)	-0.035 (0.033)	-0.002 (0.005)	0.010 (0.075)	0.003 (0.009)	0.020 (0.016)	0.144 (0.093)	-0.029 (0.021)
After attack:France	-0.032 (0.105)	0.001 (0.118)	0.097 (0.157)	-0.040 (0.299)	0.046 (0.098)	0.058 (0.048)	0.043 (0.201)	-0.011 (0.092)
Control:After attack:France	0.013 (0.016)	0.027 (0.069)	-0.003 (0.011)	0.041 (0.115)	0.003 (0.023)	-0.005 (0.036)	0.012 (0.207)	0.041 (0.050)
France	0.280*** (0.095)	0.306** (0.124)	-0.092 (0.143)	-0.105 (0.291)	0.099 (0.080)	0.117*** (0.039)	0.034 (0.168)	0.148** (0.070)
Control:France	-0.027* (0.016)	-0.108 (0.074)	0.017* (0.010)	0.092 (0.108)	0.004 (0.019)	0.019 (0.030)	0.103 (0.172)	-0.040 (0.040)
TV use (log)	-0.016** (0.007)	-0.016** (0.007)	-0.022*** (0.007)	-0.022*** (0.007)				-0.019*** (0.007)
Age (Centered)	-0.001** (0.001)	-0.001** (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)	-0.001** (0.001)	-0.001** (0.001)	-0.001** (0.001)	-0.001** (0.001)
Female	-0.023 (0.018)	-0.024 (0.018)	-0.010 (0.018)	-0.009 (0.018)	-0.021 (0.018)	-0.021 (0.018)	-0.023 (0.018)	-0.025 (0.018)
Income (decile)			0.005 (0.003)	0.006* (0.003)	0.002 (0.004)	0.001 (0.004)	0.001 (0.004)	-0.002 (0.004)
Education(Upper Secondary as baseline)								
Less Than Lower Secondary	-0.021 (0.029)	-0.021 (0.029)			-0.006 (0.028)	-0.005 (0.028)	-0.009 (0.028)	-0.006 (0.028)
Lower Secondary	-0.038	-0.045			-0.046	-0.040	-0.046	-0.033

	(0.048)	(0.048)			(0.047)	(0.046)	(0.046)	(0.047)
Advanced Vocational	0.024	0.022			0.038	0.041	0.040	0.034
	(0.033)	(0.033)			(0.033)	(0.032)	(0.032)	(0.032)
Tertiary Education	0.145***	0.145***			0.161***	0.156***	0.157***	0.128***
	(0.031)	(0.030)			(0.030)	(0.030)	(0.030)	(0.030)
Region CZ0	-0.076	-0.051	-0.266*	-0.341	-0.285***	-0.256***	-0.376**	-0.126***
	(0.086)	(0.118)	(0.151)	(0.386)	(0.076)	(0.037)	(0.172)	(0.048)
Region DE3	0.342***	0.400***	-0.027	-0.699	0.325***	0.277***	0.171	0.235***
	(0.107)	(0.139)	(0.190)	(0.461)	(0.078)	(0.044)	(0.106)	(0.091)
Region DE7	0.380***	0.430***	0.069	-0.122	0.274***	0.189***	0.010	0.283***
	(0.110)	(0.144)	(0.178)	(0.436)	(0.095)	(0.047)	(0.303)	(0.101)
Region DE9	0.505***	0.543***	0.134	-0.208	0.441***	0.366***	0.347***	0.322***
	(0.130)	(0.178)	(0.226)	(0.558)	(0.086)	(0.048)	(0.044)	(0.110)
Region FI1	0.111	0.165	-0.139	-0.345	-0.050	-0.008	-0.098	-0.004
	(0.087)	(0.118)	(0.122)	(0.289)	(0.064)	(0.031)	(0.119)	(0.056)
Region NL2	0.175**	0.191	-0.500***	-1.337***	-0.062	-0.022	-0.237*	0.018
	(0.085)	(0.117)	(0.150)	(0.363)	(0.069)	(0.034)	(0.144)	(0.060)
Control:Region CZ0	-0.031**	-0.119*	0.001	0.033	0.006	0.017	0.137	-0.106***
	(0.014)	(0.070)	(0.011)	(0.147)	(0.015)	(0.028)	(0.175)	(0.036)
Control:Region DE3	-0.010	-0.068	0.022*	0.374**	-0.012	0.010	0.124	-0.004
	(0.017)	(0.082)	(0.012)	(0.168)	(0.019)	(0.021)	(0.115)	(0.046)
Control:Region DE7	-0.036**	-0.155*	0.009	0.120	-0.030	-0.026	0.179	-0.088*
	(0.017)	(0.082)	(0.011)	(0.161)	(0.023)	(0.047)	(0.305)	(0.050)
Control:Region DE9	-0.030	-0.127	0.013	0.200	-0.035*	-0.098		-0.026
	(0.020)	(0.100)	(0.015)	(0.210)	(0.021)	(0.060)		(0.058)
Control:Region FI1	-0.021	-0.102	0.010	0.134	0.011	0.019	0.110	-0.017
	(0.014)	(0.068)	(0.008)	(0.106)	(0.015)	(0.022)	(0.123)	(0.035)
Control:Region NL2	-0.031**	-0.117*	0.036***	0.509***	0.011	0.035	0.246*	-0.036
	(0.014)	(0.068)	(0.010)	(0.135)	(0.014)	(0.024)	(0.148)	(0.034)
Observations	843	843	838	838	843	843	843	842
R ²	0.390	0.388	0.382	0.377	0.385	0.389	0.388	0.413
Adjusted R ²	0.371	0.368	0.365	0.360	0.366	0.369	0.369	0.393

Note:

$p < 0.1$; $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.01$