

Supplemental file

Traditions of Regional Citizenship. Explaining Subnational Variation of the Right to Health Care for Undocumented Immigrants

Lorenzo Piccoli

Appendix A1. Data used

Table A1.1. Relevant legislation surveyed

Country	Type of legislation	Title in English	Title in the original language	Date
Italy	National legislation	Constitution	Costituzione della Repubblica Italiana	1947 December 22
Italy	National legislation	Legislative Decree no. 286/1998	Testo unico delle disposizioni concernenti la disciplina dell'immigrazione e norme sulla condizione dello straniero	1998 July 25
Italy	National legislation	Presidential Decree no. 394/1999	Decreto del Presidente della Repubblica in materia di immigrazione	1999 August 31
Italy	National legislation	Circular no. 5/2000 of the Health Department	Indicazioni applicative del decreto legislativo 25 luglio 1998, n. 286 'Testo unico delle disposizioni concernenti la disciplina dell'immigrazione e norme sulla condizione dello straniero' - Disposizioni in materia di assistenza sanitaria.	2000 March 24
Italy	National legislation	Decree no. 33 of the Presidency of the Council of Ministers	Definizione dei livelli essenziali di assistenza	2001 November 29
Italy	National legislation	Agreement no. 255/2012 between the State and the Regions and the Autonomous Provinces of Trento and Bolzano	Accordo sul documento recante: 'Indicazioni per la corretta applicazione delle normative per l'assistenza sanitaria alla popolazione straniera da parte delle Regioni e Province autonome'	2012 December 20
Italy	Regional legislation, Tuscany	Law no. 343	Statuto della Regione Toscana	1971 May 22
Italy	Regional legislation, Tuscany	Statutory regional law no. 1/2004	Statuto della Regione Toscana	2004 July 19
Italy	Regional legislation, Tuscany	Regional law no. 29/2009	Norme per l'accoglienza, l'integrazione partecipe e la tutela dei cittadini stranieri nella Regione Toscana	2009 June 9
Italy	Regional legislation, Tuscany	Regional guidelines	Iscrizione volontaria al SSR cittadini comunitari ed iscrizione volontaria al SSR delle persone straniere ultrasessantacinquenni non appartenenti all'U.E	2011 May 4
Italy	Regional legislation, Tuscany	Regional decree no. 1139/2014	Linee guida regionali per l'applicazione della normativa sull'assistenza sanitaria dei cittadini non italiani presenti in Toscana	2014 December 9
Italy	Regional legislation, Tuscany	Regional decree no. 91/2014	Piano Sanitario e Sociale Integrato Regionale (2012-2015)	2014 November 5
Italy	Regional legislation, Tuscany	Regional guidelines	Linee guida regionali per l'applicazione della normativa sull'assistenza sanitaria dei cittadini non italiani presenti in Toscana di cui alla DGRT n.1139/2014. Ulteriori precisazioni.	2016 January 14
Italy	Regional legislation, Lombardy	Law no. 339/1971	Statuto della Regione Lombardia	1971 May 22
Italy	Regional legislation, Lombardy	Law no. 38/1988	Interventi a tutela degli immigrati extracomunitari in Lombardia e delle loro famiglie	1988 July 4
Italy	Regional legislation, Lombardy	Statutory regional law no. 1/2008	Statuto d'autonomia della Lombardia	2008 August 30
Spain	National legislation	Constitution	Constitución española	1978 October 31
Spain	National legislation	Law no. 14/1986	Ley General de Sanidad	1986 April 29
Spain	National legislation	Law no. 4/2000	Ley Orgánica sobre derechos y libertades de los extranjeros en España	2000 January 11
Spain	National legislation	Law no. 33/2011	Ley General de Salud Pública	2011 October 5

Spain	National legislation	Royal Decree no. 16/2012	Medidas urgentes para garantizar la sostenibilidad del Sistema Nacional de Salud y mejorar la calidad y seguridad de sus prestaciones	2012 April 24
Spain	Regional legislation, Andalusia	Organic Law no. 2/2007	Estatuto de Autonomía para Andalucía	2007 November 2
Spain	Regional legislation, Andalusia	Regional Law no. 16/2011	Ley de Salud Pública de Andalucía	2011 December 23
Spain	Regional legislation, Andalusia	Regional instructions of the Dirección General de Asistencia Sanitaria y Resultados en Salud del Servicio Andaluz de Salud	Instrucciones sobre el reconocimiento del derecho a la asistencia sanitaria en centros del Sistema Sanitario Público de Andalucía a personas extranjeras en situación administrativa irregular y sin recursos	2013 June 6
Spain	Regional legislation, Madrid	Organic Law no. 3/1983	Estatuto de Autonomía de la Comunidad de Madrid	1983 February 25
Spain	Regional legislation, Madrid	Regional instructions of the Consejería de Sanidad de Asistencia Sanitaria del Servicio Salud de Madrid	Instrucciones sobre la asistencia sanitaria a prestar por el servicio madrileño de salud a todas aquellas personas que no tengan la condición de asegurado o beneficiario	2012 August 27

Table A1.2. List of interviews by country, type of contact, title, date, place

Country	Type of contact	Title	Date	Place
Italy	Expert	Associate professor, Università di Bologna, Dipartimento di Scienze Politiche e Sociali	2016 February 2	Forlì
Italy	Expert	Associate professor, Università di Trento, Dipartimento di Giurisprudenza	2016 February 23	Trento
Italy	Policy maker	Legal consultant for Emilia Romagna, Trentino, South Tyrol in cases of constitutional litigation with the state	2016 February 25	Trento
Italy	NGO member	National coordinator, Area Salute Caritas Diocesana	2016 July 7	Roma
Italy	Policy-maker	Senate of the Republic, Commissione permanente Affari Costituzionali	2016 October 10	Rome
Italy	Health care professional	Doctor, Ospedale di Coverciano	2016 October 10	Florence
Italy	NGO member	Coordinator, Area Salute Caritas Diocesana Firenze	2016 November 18	Florence
Italy	Health care professional	Doctor and psychiatrist, Centro di Cognitivismo Clinico di Firenze e Prato	2016 November 18	Florence
Italy	Policy-maker	Coordinator 'Piano regionale di prevenzione, indicatori epidemiologici sullo stato di salute delle popolazioni svantaggiate e destinatarie di politiche di inclusione sociale', Agenzia Regionale di Sanità della Toscana	2016 November 18	Florence
Italy	Health care professional	Doctor, Ospedale di Firenze	2016 November 18	Florence
Italy	NGO member	NAGA, Associazione Volontaria di Assistenza Socio-Sanitaria e per i Diritti di Cittadini Stranieri, Rom e Sinti onlus	2016 November 22	Milan
Italy	NGO member	NAGA, Associazione Volontaria di Assistenza Socio-Sanitaria e per i Diritti di Cittadini Stranieri, Rom e Sinti onlus	2016 November 22	Milan
Italy	Health care professional	Doctor, Ambulatorio Caritas Lodi	2016 November 23	Milan
Italy	Expert	Professor, Università di Milano, Dipartimento di Scienze Politiche	2016 November 23	Milan
Italy	Expert	Professor, Università di Torino, Laboratorio Diritti Fondamentali	2017 March 2	Torino
Italy	Health care professional	Doctor, Servizio Regionale di Epidemiologia, ASL 5 Piemonte	2017 March 3	Torino
Spain	Expert	Professor, Universidad Complutense de Madrid	2016 March 22	Madrid
Spain	Expert	Professor, Centre for Political and Constitutional Studies	2016 March 22	Madrid
Spain	Expert	Professor, Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia, Departamento de Ciencia Política y de la Administración	2016 March 22	Madrid
Spain	NGO member	Coordinator, Departamento de Migraciones, Unión General de Trabajadores	2016 March 28	Madrid
Spain	Expert	Associate Professor, Universidad Pablo de Olavide de Sevilla, Departamento de Sociología	2016 March 30	Seville

Spain	Policy-maker	Member of the Observatorio Permanente Andaluz de las Migraciones	2016 March 30	Seville
Spain	Health care professional	Doctor, Medicina Preventiva y Salud Pública, Escuela Nacional de Sanidad	2016 June 6	Madrid
Spain	Health care professional	Doctor, Centros de Investigación Biomédica en Red de Epidemiología y Salud Pública	2017 March 9	Madrid
Spain	NGO member	Member of the Area Migraciones, Asociacion Pro Derechos Humanos Andalucia	2017 March 17	Seville
Spain	Policy-maker	Coordinator, Delegación Territorial de la Consejería de Salud Andaluza en Cádiz	2017 March 17	Cadiz
Spain	NGO member	Coordinator, Médicos del Mundo de Andalucía	2017 March 21	Seville
Spain	NGO member	Coordinator, Area Inmigraciones, Cruz Roja de Andalucia	2017 March 21	Cordoba
Spain	Expert	Professor, Universidad de Sevilla, Facultad de Derecho	2017 March 22	Seville
Spain	NGO member	Coordinator, Area Juridica, Andalucia ACOGE	2017 March 22	Seville
Spain	Policy-maker	Coordinadora Salud Pública, Junta Autonómica de Andalucía	2017 March 22	Seville
Spain	Health care professional	Doctor, Medicina Preventiva y Salud Pública, Escuela Nacional de Sanidad	2017 March 23	Madrid
Spain	Policy-maker	Member of the Consejo Ciudadano, Ayuntamiento de Córdoba	2017 March 24	Cordoba
Spain	Expert	Professor, Centre for Political and Constitutional Studies, Madrid	2017 March 24	Madrid
Spain	Policy-maker	Vice-director general, Prevención y Promoción de la Salud en Madrid Salud, Ayuntamiento de Madrid	2017 March 27	Madrid
Spain	NGO member	Coordinador Area inmigracion Asociacion Pro Derechos Humanos Andalucia	2017 March 27	Cordoba
Spain	Expert	Researcher, Instituto de Salud Carlos III, Escuela Nacional de Sanidad	2017 March 27	Madrid
Spain	NGO member	National advocacy officer, Médicos del Mundo	2017 March 27	Madrid
Spain	Health care professional	Doctor, Hospital Ramón y Cajal, Servicio de Enfermedades Infecciosas	2017 March 28	Madrid
Spain	NGO member	Técnico de proyectos Area de Inmigración y Salud, Médicos del Mundo Comunidad de Madrid	2017 March 28	Madrid
Spain	NGO member	National coordinator, Yo si sanidad universal	2017 April 6	Madrid

Table A1.3. List of questions, trace for the interviews

Who is the interviewee?

1. Role and position in the organisation
2. Time of service in the organisation
3. Parallel/other activities

What does this organisation/institution do?

4. General field of work
5. For how long has this organisation/institution existed?
6. Why was this organisation/institution established?

How is health care organised in the region?

7. What is the situation of health care for vulnerable groups, historically?
8. What are the most important events that have happened over the last fifteen years?
9. What are the most important actors in this context?
10. What is the most important legislation in this context?

What is your organisation/institution's understanding of health care for undocumented immigrants?

11. Who should be included in health care and under what conditions?
12. Is health treated as a right or as a service?
13. What are the specific activities of the organisation that relate to the topic of health care for vulnerable groups?
14. For how long have these specific activities existed?
15. Why were these activities established?

If a health care service: How is the day-to-day job?

- i. What are the main sources of funding for this structure?
- ii. Who are the users (age, gender, legal status)?
- iii. What are the requirements for access?
- iv. How many persons are affected by the activities of the organisation?

Who are the most important actors with whom your organisation/institution has worked over the last fifteen years?

16. Can you list the most important actors in this field?
17. With what actors has your organisation collaborated?
 - i. International organisations
 - ii. Public institutions: state, regional, municipal
 - iii. Hospitals
 - iv. NGOs
18. With what actors have there been disagreements?

How is health care for undocumented immigrants organised in the region today?

19. How do undocumented immigrants access health care?
20. What requirements should they fulfil?
21. Are there barriers to access to health care and what is their nature: social, political, linguistic, economic?

What are the costs of the services for undocumented immigrants?

22. Is a model of universal access to health care financially sustainable?
23. What are the costs of providing services to undocumented immigrants?
24. How are these costs covered?
25. Was there an effect of financial cuts on the provision of these services in particular?
26. Are there situations of discretion where an individual can decide autonomously whether to provide access or not?

What are the most recent developments?

27. Have there been important political changes in the last few months?
28. Are there changes that are likely to happen in the next future?
29. What is the health care situation of undocumented immigrants in the region?
30. Are there publicly available data on this that can be accessed?

Appendix A2. Background information for the comparison

Table A2.1. Pairs of regions selected: main features

Country	Region	Federal system	Health System	Partisan politics	Important urban centers	Special fiscal revenues	Special autonomy powers	Share of immigrants relative to the resident population
Spain	Madrid	Quasi-federal	Sistema Nacional de Salud	Since 1995 relative majority: PP	Yes	No	No	825.001 12.5%
	Andalusia	Quasi-federal	Sistema Nacional de Salud	Since 1978 relative majority PSOE	Yes	No	No	618.791 7.3%
Italy	Lombardy	Regional	Sistema Sanitario Nazionale	Since 1994 relative majority: FI/PDL and LN	Yes	No	No	1.153.835 11.4%
	Tuscany	Regional	Sistema Sanitario Nazionale	Since 1970 relative majority: PCI/PD	Yes	No	No	408.463 10.9%

The sources for the number of immigrants and the total number of residents in the regions are: ISTAT Official Statistics on the Population on January 1 2018 (for the Italian regions) and INE Official Numbers on the Population from the Padrón Municipal on January 1 2018 (for the Spanish autonomous communities).

Appendix A3. Composition of the regional councils

Table A3.1. Regional Council of Andalusia, 1982 – 2015

Legislature	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII	IX	X
Start	1982	1986	1990	1994	1996	2000	2004	2008	2012	2015
End	1986	1990	1994	1996	2000	2004	2008	2012	2012	-
Grupo Andalucista	3 2.6%	-	6 5.6%	3 2.7%	4 3.6%	3 2.7%	5 4.6%	-	-	-
Grupo Centrista Andaluz	11 10.1%	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Grupo Ciudadanos	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8 7.3%
Grupo Izquierda Unida	6 5.6%	17 15.6%	11 10.1%	20 18.4%	13 11.9%	6 5.6%	6 5.6%	6 5.5%	12 11%	5 4.6%
Grupo Mixto	10 9.2%	13 11.9%	4 3.6%	-	-	2 1.8%	-	-	-	1 0.9%
Grupo Podemos	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	15 13.8%
Grupo Popular	17 15.6%	19 17.5%	26 23.8%	41 37.6%	40 36.7%	46 42.2%	37 33.9%	46 42.6%	50 45.9%	33 30.3%
Grupo Socialista	62 56.9%	60 55%	62 56.9%	45 41.3%	52 47.4%	52 47.7%	61 55.9%	56 51.89%	47 43.1%	47 43.1%
Total	109 100%	109 100%	109 100%	109 100%	109 100%	109 100%	109 100%	108 100%	109 100%	109 100%

Table A3.2. Regional Council of Madrid, 1983 – 2015

Legislature	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII	IX	X
Start	1983	1987	1991	1995	1999	2003	2003	2007	2011	2015
End	1987	1991	1995	1999	2003	2003	2007	2011	2015	-
Grupo Ciudadanos	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	17 13.2%
Grupo Centro Democrático y Social	-	17 17.7%	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Grupo Izquierda Unida	9 9.5%	7 7.3%	13 12.9%	17 16.5%	8 7.8%	9 8.2%	9 8.2%	11 9.2%	13 10.1%	-
Grupo Podemos	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	27 20.9%
Grupo Popular	34 36.2%	32 33.3%	47 46.5%	54 52.4%	55 53.9%	55 49.5%	57 51.3%	67 55.8%	72 55.8%	48 37.2%
Grupo Socialista	51 54.3%	40 41.7%	41 40.6%	32 31.1%	39 38.3%	47 42.3%	45 40.5%	42 35%	36 27.9%	37 28.7%
Unión Progreso y Democracia	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8 6.2%	-
Total	94 100%	96 100%	101 100%	103 100%	102 100%	111 100%	111 100%	120 100%	129 100%	129 100%

Table A3.3. Regional Council of Tuscany, 1970 – 2015

Legislature	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII	IX	X
Start	1970	1975	1980	1985	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010	2015
End	1975	1980	1985	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010	2015	-
Gruppo Alleanza Nazionale	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6 9.2%	-	-
Gruppo Democrazia Cristiana	16 32%	15 30%	14 28%	14 28%	14 28%	-	-	-	-	-
Gruppo Forza Italia / P.D.L.	-	-	-	-	-	7 14%	9 18%	10 15.3%	16 24.6%	2 5%
Gruppo Misto / Altri	4 8%	4 8%	5 10%	5 10%	8 16%	3 6%	12 24%	11 16.9%	10 15.3%	-
Gruppo Lega Nord	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3 4.6%	6 15%
Gruppo Movimento 5 Stelle	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	9 13.8%	5 12.5%
Gruppo P.C.I / P.D.S.	23 46%	25 50%	25 50%	25 50%	21 42%	20 40%	18 36%	-	-	-
Gruppo Sinistra Europea / Sinistra Ecologia Libertà	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5 7.6%	3 4.6%	2 5%
Gruppo Socialista	7 14%	6 12%	6 12%	6 12%	7 14%	8 16%	-	-	-	-
Gruppo Toscana Democratica / Ulivo / P.D.	-	-	-	-	-	12 24%	11 22%	33 50.8%	24 36.9%	25 62.5%
Total	50 100%	50 100%	50 100%	50 100%	50 100%	50 100%	50 100%	65 100%	65 100%	40 100%

Table A3.4. Regional Council of Lombardy, 1970 – 2015

Legislature	I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII	IX	X
Start	1970	1975	1980	1985	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010	2013
End	1975	1980	1985	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010	2013	2015
Gruppo Alleanza Nazionale	-	-	-	-	-	8 8.9%	6 7.5%	5 6.3%	-	-
Gruppo Democrazia Cristiana	36 48%	32 40%	34 42.5%	31 38.8%	25 31.3%	-	-	-	-	-
Gruppo Forza Italia / P.D.L.	-	-	-	-	-	28 31.1%	27 33.7%	25 31.2%	28 35%	19 23.7%
Gruppo Lega Nord	-	-	-	-	15 18.7%	12 13.3%	13 16.3%	16 20%	18 22.5%	26 32.5%
Gruppo Misto / Altri	11 14.6%	12 15%	12 15%	15 18.7%	13 16.3%	12 13.3%	8 10%	10 12.5%	12 15%	4 5%
Gruppo Movimento 5 Stelle	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	9 12%
Gruppo Partito Popolare Italiani / P.D.	-	-	-	-	-	4 4.4%	21 26.2%	21 26.2%	22 27.5%	21 26.3%
Gruppo P.C.I. / P.D.S.	19 25.4%	25 31.3%	23 28.8%	22 27.5%	15 18.7%	11 12.2%	-	-	-	-
Gruppo di Rifondazione Comunista	-	-	-	-	-	5 5.6%	5 6.3%	3 3.8%	-	-
Gruppo Socialista	9 12%	11 13.7%	11 13.7%	12 15%	12 15%	-	-	-	-	-
Total	75 100%	80 100%	80 100%	80 100%	80 100%	90 100%	80 100%	80 100%	80 100%	80 100%