**APPENDIX A: Data sources.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Variable** | **Source** |
| **Germany** | **Spain** |
| Sub-national governments composition | Jun, Haas, and Niedermayer (2008); Kost, Rellecke, and Weber (2010); Mielke and Reutter (2012) | Reniu and Matas-Dalmases (2016)<http://www.ub.edu/OGC/index_es.htm> |
| ENPP and electoral data | Schakel (2013) and *Wahlen in Deutschland* (<http://www.wahlen-in-deutschland.de>) | ARGOS dataset (http://www.argos.gva.es/ahe/) |
| Unemployment | Bundesagentur für Arbeit 2017 (<https://statistik.arbeitsagentur.de/>). Unfortunately, in Germany there is no regional-level data available before 1968. Thus, we used the federal unemployment rate for this period. | Instituto Nacional de Estadística (http://www.ine.es/) |
| Federal government composition | Strøm, Müller and Bergman (2008) |
| Regional Authority Index | Hooghe et al. (2016) |

**APPENDIX B: Summary statistics and correlations table.**

**Summary statistics.**

**Spain**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Mean | SD | Min | Max | N |
| One-Party-Majority | .4678721 | .499004 | 0 | 1 | 6692 |
| Oversized coalition | .005529 | .0741569 | 0 | 1 | 6692 |
| Majoritarian coalition | .1933652 | .3949664 | 0 | 1 | 6692 |
| Minoritarian coalition | .0869695 | .2818114 | 0 | 1 | 6692 |
| One-Party-Minority | .2462642 | .4308664 | 0 | 1 | 6692 |
| Cohesive Gov. | .9686192 | .1743575 | 0 | 1 | 6692 |
| CIEP | 24.66273 | 13.37908 | 0 | 48 | 6692 |
| ENPP | 2.839533 | .7895551 | 1.672172 | 5.653266 | 6692 |
| Years since first election (Log) | 1.031787 | .4508563 | 0 | 1.556303 | 6692 |
| Change Unemployment | 11.40916 | 41.33643 | -60.82949 | 330.101 | 6692 |
| RAI Self-rule | 13.50224 | .8659146 | 9 | 15 | 6692 |
| RAI Shared-rule | 8.810371 | .9935046 | 6.5 | 10.5 | 6692 |
| V. Congruence | 52.06598 | 47.21126 | 0 | 100 | 6692 |
| H. Congruence | 28.8761 | 21.37344 | 5.882353 | 100 | 6692 |

**Germany**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Mean | SD | Min | Max | N |
| One-Party-Majority | .314434 | .4643137 | 0 | 1 | 9824 |
| Oversized coalition | .1130904 | .3167194 | 0 | 1 | 9824 |
| Majoritarian coalition | .5374593 | .4986202 | 0 | 1 | 9824 |
| Minoritarian coalition | .0243282 | .1540738 | 0 | 1 | 9824 |
| One-Party-Minority | .0106881 | .1028346 | 0 | 1 | 9824 |
| Cohesive Gov. | .7914292 | .4063076 | 0 | 1 | 9824 |
| CIEP | 26.87419 | 15.22954 | -9 | 60 | 9824 |
| ENPP | 2.739993 | .6097536 | 1.830884 | 5.52677 | 9824 |
| Years since first election (Log) | 1.364917 | .4061295 | 0 | 1.845098 | 9824 |
| Change Unemployment | 7.378633 | 55.37449 | -91.89189 | 699.9999 | 9824 |
| RAI Self-rule | 15.36665 | .7739074 | 15 | 17 | 9824 |
| RAI Shared-rule | 10.40106 | 1.596399 | 7 | 12 | 9824 |
| V. Congruence | 55.50271 | 43.2942 | 0 | 100 | 9824 |
| H. Congruence | 23.91628 | 12.92594 | 6.25 | 66.66666 | 9824 |

**All**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Mean | SD | Min | Max | N |
| One-Party-Majority | .3766045 | .484549 | 0 | 1 | 16516 |
| Oversized coalition | .0695084 | .2543243 | 0 | 1 | 16516 |
| Majoritarian coalition | .3980383 | .4895082 | 0 | 1 | 16516 |
| Minoritarian coalition | .0497094 | .2173504 | 0 | 1 | 16516 |
| One-Party-Minority | .1061395 | .3080254 | 0 | 1 | 16516 |
| Cohesive Gov. | .8632235 | .3436216 | 0 | 1 | 16516 |
| CIEP | 25.97814 | 14.54838 | -9 | 60 | 16516 |
| ENPP | 2.780325 | .6899994 | 1.672172 | 5.653266 | 16516 |
| Years since first election (Log) | 1.229938 | .4552014 | 0 | 1.845098 | 16516 |
| Change Unemployment | 9.011734 | 50.19983 | -91.89189 | 699.9999 | 16516 |
| RAI Self-rule | 14.61123 | 1.223859 | 9 | 17 | 16516 |
| RAI Shared-rule | 9.756539 | 1.589209 | 6.5 | 12 | 16516 |
| V. Congruence | 54.11021 | 44.95277 | 0 | 100 | 16516 |
| H. Congruence | 25.92591 | 17.04077 | 5.882353 | 100 | 16516 |

**Table 3: Matrices of correlations.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  Variables: Spain |  (1) |  (2) |  (3) |  (4) |  (5) |  (6) |  (7) |  (8) |  (9) |  (10) |  (11) |  (12) |  (13) |  (14) |
| (1) One-Party-Majority | 1.000 |
| (2) One-Party-Majority | -0.070 | 1.000 |
| (3) Oversized coalition | -0.459 | -0.037 | 1.000 |
| (4) Majoritarian coalition | -0.289 | -0.023 | -0.151 | 1.000 |
| (5) Minoritarian coalition | -0.536 | -0.043 | -0.280 | -0.176 | 1.000 |
| (6) Cohesive Gov. | 0.169 | -0.356 | 0.021 | -0.389 | 0.101 | 1.000 |
| (7) CIEP | -0.053 | 0.013 | 0.016 | 0.028 | 0.026 | -0.025 | 1.000 |
| (8) ENPP | -0.651 | -0.020 | 0.215 | 0.404 | 0.297 | -0.125 | 0.056 | 1.000 |
| (9) Years since first election (Log)  | -0.035 | -0.066 | 0.199 | 0.061 | -0.170 | -0.053 | 0.048 | -0.002 | 1.000 |
| (10) Change Unemployment | 0.077 | -0.017 | 0.076 | -0.100 | -0.091 | -0.049 | -0.109 | -0.140 | 0.007 | 1.000 |
| (11) RAI Self-rule  | 0.111 | -0.043 | 0.080 | -0.205 | -0.060 | 0.203 | -0.039 | -0.243 | 0.390 | 0.034 | 1.000 |
| (12) RAI Shared-rule | -0.124 | -0.149 | 0.161 | 0.150 | -0.077 | -0.092 | -0.036 | 0.158 | 0.870 | 0.010 | 0.294 | 1.000 |
| (13) V. Congruence | 0.295 | -0.072 | -0.058 | -0.250 | -0.113 | 0.114 | -0.089 | -0.257 | -0.183 | -0.011 | -0.003 | -0.204 | 1.000 |
| (14) H. Congruence | 0.540 | -0.080 | -0.420 | -0.265 | -0.054 | 0.167 | -0.014 | -0.416 | -0.398 | 0.072 | 0.003 | -0.393 | 0.562 | 1.000 |
|  |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  Variables: Germany |  (1) |  (2) |  (3) |  (4) |  (5) |  (6) |  (7) |  (8) |  (9) |  (10) |  (11) |  (12) |  (13) |  (14) |
| (1) One-Party-Majority | 1.000 |
| (2) One-Party-Majority | -0.242 | 1.000 |
| (3) Oversized coalition | -0.730 | -0.385 | 1.000 |
| (4) Majoritarian coalition | -0.107 | -0.056 | -0.170 | 1.000 |
| (5) Minoritarian coalition | -0.070 | -0.037 | -0.112 | -0.016 | 1.000 |
| (6) Cohesive Gov. | 0.348 | -0.006 | -0.356 | 0.081 | 0.053 | 1.000 |
| (7) CIEP | -0.020 | -0.061 | 0.041 | 0.030 | 0.033 | -0.021 | 1.000 |
| (8) ENPP | -0.543 | -0.036 | 0.479 | 0.149 | 0.019 | -0.448 | 0.083 | 1.000 |
| (9) Years since first election (Log)  | 0.126 | -0.347 | 0.126 | -0.047 | -0.040 | 0.105 | 0.072 | -0.089 | 1.000 |
| (10) Change Unemployment | 0.139 | -0.149 | -0.019 | -0.052 | -0.000 | 0.129 | -0.097 | -0.176 | 0.003 | 1.000 |
| (11) RAI Self-rule  | -0.242 | 0.589 | -0.160 | 0.063 | -0.042 | -0.105 | -0.056 | 0.108 | -0.516 | -0.249 | 1.000 |
| (12) RAI Shared-rule | 0.188 | -0.594 | 0.205 | -0.031 | 0.032 | 0.061 | 0.073 | 0.001 | 0.558 | 0.201 | -0.966 | 1.000 |
| (13) V. Congruence | -0.200 | -0.023 | 0.202 | 0.009 | -0.019 | -0.020 | -0.073 | 0.127 | -0.048 | 0.005 | -0.012 | 0.017 | 1.000 |
| (14) H. Congruence | 0.292 | -0.177 | -0.180 | 0.002 | 0.096 | 0.218 | 0.010 | -0.327 | 0.185 | 0.215 | -0.257 | 0.249 | -0.002 | 1.000 |
|  |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  Variables: All |  (1) |  (2) |  (3) |  (4) |  (5) |  (6) |  (7) |  (8) |  (9) |  (10) |  (11) |  (12) |  (13) |  (14) |
| (1) One-Party-Majority | 1.000 |
| (2) One-Party-Majority | -0.212 | 1.000 |
| (3) Oversized coalition | -0.632 | -0.222 | 1.000 |
| (4) Majoritarian coalition | -0.178 | -0.063 | -0.186 | 1.000 |
| (5) Minoritarian coalition | -0.268 | -0.094 | -0.280 | -0.079 | 1.000 |
| (6) Cohesive Gov. | 0.309 | -0.079 | -0.339 | -0.027 | 0.137 | 1.000 |
| (7) CIEP | -0.044 | -0.030 | 0.057 | 0.016 | -0.008 | -0.039 | 1.000 |
| (8) ENPP | -0.573 | -0.041 | 0.312 | 0.308 | 0.222 | -0.290 | 0.064 | 1.000 |
| (9) Years since first election (Log)  | -0.007 | -0.162 | 0.257 | -0.037 | -0.237 | -0.036 | 0.085 | -0.068 | 1.000 |
| (10) Change Unemployment | 0.120 | -0.132 | -0.006 | -0.062 | -0.028 | 0.102 | -0.103 | -0.152 | -0.010 | 1.000 |
| (11) RAI Self-rule | -0.171 | 0.428 | 0.215 | -0.165 | -0.310 | -0.207 | 0.024 | -0.097 | 0.206 | -0.125 | 1.000 |
| (12) RAI Shared-rule | -0.001 | -0.351 | 0.327 | -0.033 | -0.205 | -0.093 | 0.074 | 0.011 | 0.692 | 0.115 | 0.055 | 1.000 |
| (13) V. Congruence | 0.014 | -0.017 | 0.111 | -0.140 | -0.085 | 0.002 | -0.076 | -0.063 | -0.088 | -0.002 | 0.023 | -0.026 | 1.000 |
| (14) H. Congruence | 0.431 | -0.141 | -0.304 | -0.154 | 0.030 | 0.195 | -0.012 | -0.362 | -0.177 | 0.143 | -0.179 | -0.083 | 0.294 | 1.000 |
|  |

**APPENDIX C: Replication results using RILE difference (Germany 1990-2017).**

We acknowledge that we cannot control for an important predictor in models of early (national) government termination: the ideological preference range of the cabinet. Despite there are several national level data sources available as Manifesto Data, voters’ placement or expert surveys, no equivalent source exists for the period we investigate at the regional level. In the specific case of Germany, we can include regional level party positions based on quantitative text analysis. Both Bräuninger and Debus (2012) as well as Baumann, Debus, and Gross (2017) applied the Wordscores technique to regional election manifestos, compared with the national manifestos, in order to extract the party position at the regional level. Data on all major German parties is provided since 1990, thus we replicate our models using a subset of the observations controlling for the government’s ideological preferences. Specifically, we include the government’s ideological dissimilarity which is calculated taking the difference between the maximum and the minimum position of each party belonging to the government on the left-right axis. The models show consistent results across both operationalisations (ideological cohesiveness dummy and the more fine-grained cabinet preference range). Comparing our hand-coded with Bräuninger and Debus' (2012) data shows that the governments we coded as cohesive show much closer ideological positions than those coded as non-cohesive.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Cohesive = 1 | Cohesive = 0 |
| Mean | 1.80 | 3.96 |
| Std. Dev. | 2.92 | 2.75 |
| 95% Conf. Interval | 1.16 - 2.44 | 2.97 - 4.96 |
| N | 83 | 32 |

A t-test reveals that we can reject the null hypothesis that the variable obtained through quantitative text analysis is equal across the hand-coded groups (p-value = 0.0005).

Replication of the results comparing coherence dummy with RILE difference (Cox proportional hazards models).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | GER A1 | GER B1 |
|  |  |
| V. Congruence | 0.990 | 0.993 |
|  | (0.00902) | (0.00709) |
|  |  |  |
| H. Congruence | 0.944 | 0.951 |
|  | (0.0339) | (0.0350) |
|  |  |  |
| RAI Self-Rule | 1 | 1 |
|  | (.) | (.) |
|  |  |  |
| RAI Shared-Rule | 0.490 | 0.594 |
|  | (0.308) | (0.452) |
|  |  |  |
| One Party-Majority |  Reference category Reference category |
|  |  |  |
| Majority coalition | 1.122 | 1.305 |
|  | (1.326) | (1.325) |
|  |  |  |
| Minority coalition | 73.86\*\* | 48.46\*\* |
|  | (97.16) | (64.79) |
|  |  |  |
| One-Party-Minority | 4.67e-16\*\*\* | 7.21e-17 |
|  | (9.82e-16) | (0) |
|  |  |  |
| Cohesive Gov. | 0.259 |  |
|  | (0.230) |  |
|  |  |  |
| RILE Difference |  | 1.108 |
|  |  | (0.106) |
|  |  |  |
| CIEP | 0.905\*\*\* | 0.912\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0233) | (0.0178) |
|  |  |  |
| ENPP | 1.478 | 1.488 |
|  | (0.870) | (0.834) |
|  |  |  |
| Years since first election (Log) | 626.9\*\* | 252.2\*\*\* |
|  | (1507.5) | (416.6) |
|  |  |  |
| Change Unemployment | 0.981 | 0.978 |
|  | (0.0218) | (0.0234) |
|  |  |  |
| Observations | 4831 | 4831 |
| Log likelihood | -34.22 | -34.85 |

Hazard ratios with clustered standard errors in parentheses

\* *p* < 0.05, \*\* *p* < 0.01, \*\*\* *p* < 0.001